ORIGINAL

BEFORE THE BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS

STATE OF IDAHO

In the Matter of the License of:)	
) Case No. REA-2	006-4
THOMAS F. MULLANEY, III,)	
License No. LRA-333,) STIPULATION	AND
) CONSENT OR	DER
Respondent.)	
	······································	
REA\Mullanev\P6132lka		

WHEREAS, information having been received by the Idaho State Board of Real Estate Appraisers (hereinafter the "Board") which constitutes sufficient grounds for the initiation of an administrative action against Thomas F. Mullaney, III (hereinafter

"Respondent"); and

WHEREAS, the parties mutually agree to settle the matter pending administrative Board action in an expeditious manner; now, therefore,

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED between the undersigned parties that this matter shall be settled and resolved upon the following terms:

A.

- 1. The Board may regulate the practice of real estate appraising in the State of Idaho in accordance with title 54, chapter 41, Idaho Code.
- 2. Respondent Thomas F. Mullaney, III is a licensee of the Idaho State Board of Real Estate Appraisers and holds License No. LRA-333 to practice real estate appraising in the State of Idaho. Respondent's license is subject to the provisions of title 54, chapter 41, Idaho Code.
- 3. Appraisals in the State of Idaho must comply with the minimum standards set forth in the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practices ("USPAP").
- 4. On or about January 3, 2004, Respondent prepared an appraisal report for the 4-plex property located at 913 N. 30th Street in Boise, Idaho (the "Subject Property").

- 5. Respondent's appraisal report for the Subject Property failed to meet the following requirements of USPAP Standards (2004):
- a. Respondent failed to be sufficiently diligent in gathering factual information to ensure that the data was correct, and there were errors that might affect the opinion of value, in violation of Standards Rule 1-1(b).
- b. Respondent made a series of errors within the report which in the aggregate affected the credibility of the results, in violation of Standards Rule 1-1(c).
- c. The report failed to discuss current leases within the Subject Property (which were listed below the actual leases quoted in the appraisal), in violation of Standards Rule 1-2(iv).
- d. The report failed to adequately analyze the gross rent multipliers as provided in the sales comparison approach, all higher than the reconciled gross rent multipliers applied in the income approach, and failed to analyze comparable rental data to support the forecasted rents, in violation of Standards Rule 1-4(a) and (c).
- e. The report failed to adequately analyze the pending contract with sales concessions, in violation of Standards Rule 1-5(a).
- f. The report failed to adequately communicate each analysis, opinion and conclusion in a manner that was not misleading, in violation of Standards Rule 2.
- g. Due to canned comments and cloning errors, the report was not clearly and accurately set forth and did not contain sufficient information to understand the report properly, in violation of Standards Rules 2-1(a) and (b).
- 6. The above-stated allegations, if proven, would constitute a violation of the laws and rules governing the practice of real estate appraising, specifically Idaho Code § 54-4107(1)(e) and IDAPA 24.18.01.700. Violations of these laws and rules would further constitute grounds for disciplinary action against Respondent's license to practice real estate appraising in the State of Idaho.
- 7. Respondent, in lieu of proceeding with a formal disciplinary action to STIPULATION AND CONSENT ORDER 2

adjudicate the allegations as set forth above, hereby admits the violations and agrees to the discipline against his license as set forth in Section C below.

B.

- I, Thomas F. Mullaney, III, by affixing my signature hereto, acknowledge that:
- 1. I have read and admit the allegations pending before the Board, as stated above in section A. I further understand that these allegations constitute cause for disciplinary action upon my license to practice real estate appraising in the State of Idaho.
- 2. I understand that I have the right to a full and complete hearing; the right to confront and cross-examine witnesses; the right to present evidence or to call witnesses, or to so testify myself; the right to reconsideration; the right to appeal; and all rights accorded by the Administrative Procedure Act of the State of Idaho and the laws and rules governing the practice of real estate appraising in the State of Idaho. I hereby freely and voluntarily waive these rights in order to enter into this stipulation as a resolution of the pending allegations.
- 3. I understand that in signing this consent order I am enabling the Board to impose disciplinary action upon my license without further process.

C.

Based upon the foregoing stipulation, it is agreed that the Board may issue a decision and order upon this stipulation whereby:

- 1. Respondent shall pay to the Board an administrative fine in the amount of One Thousand and No/100 Dollars (\$1,000.00) within thirty (30) days of the entry of the Board's Order.
- 2. Respondent shall pay investigative costs and attorney fees in the amount of One Thousand Two Hundred Fifty and No/100 Dollars (\$1,250.00) within sixty (60) days of the entry of the Board's Order.
- 3. Respondent shall take a continuing education course in Small Residential Income from a Board-approved provider within six (6) months from the date of entry of

the Board's Order and shall take and pass any examinations given at the conclusion of the course. Respondent shall submit proof of attendance and proof that he passed any given examinations within 30 days of attendance. If no examinations are given at the conclusion of the class, Respondent shall submit a letter from the course instructor stating that no examinations were given. Said continuing education shall be in addition to any continuing education Respondent is required to obtain to maintain his license.

- 4. Respondent's License No. LRA-333 shall be placed on probation for a period of six (6) months from the date of entry of the Board's Order. The conditions of probation are as follows:
- a. Respondent shall maintain a log of all appraisals completed on the form attached hereto which shall be submitted to the Board on a quarterly basis (e.g., if the Board's Order is entered in June 19, 2006, Respondent's first submission shall be for appraisals performed June 20 to September 19, 2006, and the second for September 20 to December 19, 2006). At the end of each 3-month period after the entry of the Board's Order, Respondent shall submit the completed form postmarked no later than the five (5) days following the end of each 3-month period to the Board at 1109 Main Street, Suite 200, Boise, ID 83702. The Board reserves the right to review any and all appraisal reports listed on the logs kept by Respondent. Failure to submit completed logs to the Board as required above may result in additional discipline.
- b. Respondent shall comply with all state, federal and local laws, rules and regulations governing the practice of real estate appraising in the State of Idaho.
- Respondent shall inform the Board in writing of any change of place
 of practice or place of business within 15 days of such change.
- d. In the event Respondent should leave Idaho for three (3) continuous months, or to reside or practice outside of the state, Respondent must provide written notification to the Board of the dates of departure, address of intended residence or place of business, and indicate whether Respondent intends to return. Periods of time spent

outside Idaho will not apply to the reduction of this period or excuse compliance with the terms of this Stipulation.

- e. Respondent shall fully cooperate with the Board and its agents, and submit any documents or other information within a reasonable time after a request is made for such documents or information.
- f. Respondent shall make all files, records, correspondence or other documents available immediately upon the demand of any member of the Board's staff or its agents.
- 5. At the conclusion of the six-month probationary period, Respondent may request from the Board reinstatement of License No. LRA-333 without restriction. Any request for reinstatement must be accompanied by written proof of compliance with the terms of this Stipulation. The Board retains discretion to grant reinstatement of Respondent's license or to deny reinstatement and continue the period of probation.
- 6. All costs associated with compliance with the terms of this stipulation are the sole responsibility of Respondent.
- 7. The violation of any of the terms of this Stipulation by Respondent will warrant further Board action. The Board therefore retains jurisdiction over this proceeding until all matters are finally resolved as set forth in this Stipulation.

D.

- 1. It is hereby agreed between the parties that this Stipulation shall be presented to the Board with a recommendation for approval from the Deputy Attorney General responsible for prosecution before the Board at the next regularly scheduled meeting of the Board.
- 2. Respondent understands that the Board is free to accept, modify with Respondent's approval, or reject this Stipulation, and if rejected by the Board, a formal complaint may be filed against Respondent. Respondent hereby agrees to waive any right Respondent may have to challenge the impartiality of the Board to hear the disciplinary

complaint if, after review by the Board, this Stipulation is rejected.

- 3. If the Stipulation is not accepted by the Board, it shall be regarded as null and void. Admissions by Respondent in the Stipulation will not be regarded as evidence against Respondent at the subsequent disciplinary hearing.
- 4. The Consent Order shall not become effective until it has been approved by a majority of the Board and endorsed by a representative member of the Board.
- 5. Any failure on the part of Respondent to timely and completely comply with any term or condition herein shall be deemed a default.
- 6. Any default of this Stipulation and Consent Order shall be considered a violation of Idaho Code § 54-4107. If Respondent violates or fails to comply with this Stipulation and Consent Order, the Board may impose additional discipline pursuant to the following procedure:
- a. The Chief of the Bureau of Occupational Licenses shall schedule a hearing before the Board. Within twenty-one (21) days after the notice of hearing and charges is served, Respondent shall submit a response to the allegations. If Respondent does not submit a timely response to the Board, the allegations will be deemed admitted.
- b. At the hearing before the Board upon default, the Board and Respondent may submit affidavits made on personal knowledge and argument based upon the record in support of their positions. Unless otherwise ordered by the Board, the evidentiary record before the Board shall be limited to such affidavits and this Stipulation and Consent Order. Respondent waives a hearing before the Board on the facts and substantive matters related to the violations described in Section A, and waives discovery, cross-examination of adverse witnesses, and other procedures governing administrative hearings or civil trials.
- c. At the hearing, the Board will determine whether to impose additional disciplinary action, which may include conditions or limitations upon Respondent's practice or suspension or revocation of Respondent's license.

- 7. This Stipulation and Consent Order is the resolution of a contested case and is a public record.
- 8. This Stipulation and Consent Order contains the entire agreement between the parties, and Respondent is not relying on any other agreement or representation of any kind, verbal or otherwise.

I have read the above stipulation fully and have had the opportunity to discuss it with legal counsel. I understand that by its terms I will be waiving certain rights accorded me under Idaho law. I understand that the Board may either approve this stipulation as proposed, approve it subject to specified changes, or reject it. I understand that, if approved as proposed, the Board will issue an Order on this stipulation according to the aforementioned terms, and I hereby agree to the above stipulation for settlement. I understand that if the Board approves this stipulation subject to changes, and the changes are acceptable to me, the stipulation will take effect and an order modifying the terms of the stipulation will be issued. If the changes are unacceptable to me or the Board rejects this stipulation, it will be of no effect.

DATED this / S day of _______, 2006.

Thomas F. Mullaney III
Respondent

Bv

I concur in this stipulation and order.

DATED this 1 ST day of ______, 2006.

SAETRUM LAW OFFICES

David W. Lloyd

Of Attorneys for Respondent

DATED this and day of June, 2006.

STATE OF IDAHO
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

By Karl T. Klein
Deputy Attorney General

ORDER

Pursuant to Idaho Code § 54-4106, the foregoing is adopted as the decision of the Board of Real Estate Appraisers in this matter and shall be effective on the Aday of June, 2006. It is so ordered.

IDAHO STATE BOARD
OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS

寶

I concur in this stipulation and order.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on served a true and correct copy of the	this 13 th day of July, 2006, I caused to be the foregoing by the following method to:
Thomas F. Mullaney, III 1217 W. Hays Boise, ID 83702	 ✓ U.S. Mail ☐ Hand Delivery ✓ Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested ☐ Overnight Mail ☐ Facsimile: ☐ Statehouse Mail
David W. Lloyd SAETRUM LAW OFFICES 300 E. Mallard Drive, Suite 370 Boise, ID 83706	 ☑ U.S. Mail ☐ Hand Delivery ☐ Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested ☐ Overnight Mail ☐ Facsimile: ☐ Statehouse Mail
Karl T. Klein Deputy Attorney General P.O. Box 83720 Boise, ID 83720-0010	☐ U.S. Mail ☐ Hand Delivery ☐ Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested ☐ Overnight Mail ☐ Facsimile: ☐ Statehouse Mail
	Rayola Vacobsen, Chief Bureau of Occupational Licenses

		APPRA	APPRAISAL EXPERIENCE LOG	ENCE L							
Name	Address		CEV			State	2		2	ďZ	
Social Security Number	Number									£	
			4		5.			ġ.		7.	×.
2	Porce	Property	ᆂ	4	Approach(cs) Used	Used	lá .	Involvement	nt	The state of the s	***************************************
(mm/dd/yy)	Identification	Res. Res.		Ż	A C		A 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12	Red Rev.	Š Š Š Š Š	No. of Signers	Hours
		THE CONTRACT			No.	TO SECTION AND AND ADDRESS OF THE SECTION ADDRESS OF THE SECTION ADDRESS OF THE SECTION AND ADDRESS OF THE SECTION ADDRESS			***************************************		il de la composition della com
	MONOMORIA de la finalmenta a contenta a contenta a contenta a contenta a contenta de la finalmenta del finalmen				The state of the s					MANAGARAN MANAGAR	
To a post of the Colonial Colo	And a standard in the Andreas and Andreas Andr			NAMES OF THE PROPERTY OF THE P		tereprinaminany mythonocom monocompagagagagagagagagagagagagagagagagagagag		**************************************	Side Side Side Side Side Side Side Side	Street to catalogical statistic immediate (statistic and street	Vicinité allertes en sossados en dad

	WORKSON PRODUCTION OF THE PROD			Andreas de la constante de la		and development contraction of the contraction of t					Nahangan pangangan
en automatematikoko (kilokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko (kilokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko (kilokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko (kilokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko kontrolokoko (kilokoko kontrolokoko kontroloko kontr		PROVENINO NA PROPERTY AND PROPE				нятносько попиливательновымовыемымомуру			DDD DAYGOL SErvice Language		and a second contract of the second contract
						-				o de la composiçõe de l	
West 1907 (4 deleter) of the state of the st			nn-415552e48666	***************************************				***************************************	th our was		
		::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::			00.000 (00.000 co.co.co.co.co.co.co.co.co.co.co.co.co.c					NOT THE REAL PROPERTY OF THE PERSON OF THE P	de production de la constitución
	BORRAN MANAGAMAN ANA ANA ANA ANA ANA ANA ANA ANA ANA					enderadore in colorado em un casa de masa anacesa casa como casa de co			en e	ero electron el balondo de la recha un de delección per	
		denem manacama cintrativa de la companio del companio del companio de la companio del la companio de la companio de la companio del la companio de la companio del la c		000000000000000000000000000000000000000		**************************************		**COLOR COLOR COLO			Anadola had anada paning galappy () of
	And and a second	e (cidale) e inicia a constante a constant					de de la constanta de la const			COOR DESCRIPTION AND ADDRESS OF THE PROPERTY O	WEEK PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY
Manuscretterialiste de l'experimentation de l'exper		Neiribidi de un mantenamento contentra de proposition de mantenio contentra de proposition de la contentra de proposition de la contentra de l									99/HH (0000/6H
		A Well-and-William Compression of the Compression o	SESSIBILITATION CONTRACTOR CONTRA								NA A DIAMETER NAMED AND A STATE OF THE STATE
		And it is the property of the				Sporting in the contraction of t					ekeriyi uladiyasikelalassasisisis
00H9999PHANSOLG jile eKi dilirinia mahadalalakari dan mendemberantara sasanca sasanca ka						oscionalada de contrata de		-			00/300/30vaccionacionacen
Page of	pages				olenie georoadoad discontació simo od osovento	November representation and the second control of the second contr	Ē	HOH	Total Hours This Page	Page	automoratedanionoso